

**INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR STANDARDISATION  
ORGANISATION INTERNATIONALE DE NORMALISATION  
ISO/IEC JTC1/SC29/WG11  
CODING OF MOVING PICTURES AND AUDIO**

**ISO/IEC JTC1/SC29/WG11 MPEG2018/M43543  
July 2018, Ljubljana, SI**

**Source: DMAG-UPC**  
**Status: Proposal**  
**Title: MPEG-G Part 3 ballot: Pre-analysis of ballot comments**  
**Authors: Jaime Delgado, Daniel Naro, Silvia Llorente (Distributed Multimedia Applications Group - Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya, Barcelona)**

The attached document is an Excel table with the ballot comments of ISO/IEC CD 23092-3 that adds a few (3) columns with a preliminary analysis of the comments.

It is intended to help in the disposition of comments process.

SEE ATTACHED DOCUMENT.

MB/NC	Line number	Clause/Subclause	Paragraph/Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>1</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations (Current)	Proposed disposition DMAG-UPC	Classification DMAG-UPC	Notes DMAG-UPC
CH 001				ge	reference to other parts should use the ISO standard number	refer to the other parts as ISO/IEC 23092-X		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	
CH 002				ge	several fonts and other graphic notations are used but not documented	consider adding a section describing how fonts and faces are used			To be discussed	
CH 003				ge	the use of expressions such as "can be" and "could be" should be limited and when several options are possible they should be listed and described	consider revising the text and make it coherent regarding this issue		Accepted.	For editing period	
CH 004				ge	ISO recommends to use the terminology to refer to the current specification as "this document"	change "this standard" with "this document"		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	
CH 005				ge	The type "String" as well as others are not defined	Define "String" and all data types used in the document			In progress	Section 8 not defined Section 9 defines the datatypes used in the API, check if it has to be done before
CH 006				ge	MPEG-G elements such as Dataset, Dataset Group are not always capitalized as in other parts of the standard	Capitalize terms appropriately		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	Implemented in Draft-DIS for Dataset Group, Dataset, Access Unit, Descriptor Stream, Genomic Record Abbreviated forms corrected For editing period for other terms, if any
CH 007				ge	Element types used in the normative part such as ProjectCentre, ListOfSamples, etc. are not defined	Specify if they are defined in other standards and explicitly mention those standards (exact version) or define these types in this document (preferable)		Accepted.	For editing period	
DE 008			Introduction/Document	ge	Align the naming of specification-specific identifiers. Do not use abbreviated forms.	Align the naming of specification-specific identifiers (e.g. 'Dataset Group'). Do not use abbreviated forms (e.g. "don't" in 8.3.2.3).		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	Implemented in Draft-DIS for Dataset Group, Dataset, Access Unit, Descriptor Stream, Genomic Record Abbreviated forms corrected For editing period for other terms, if any
DE 009			1	ed	Use 'information metadata' in a consistent manner.	Replace 'Metadata' by 'Information metadata'.		Accepted.	For editing period	Implemented in Jan Voges' StudyOf, only section 1, not the rest of the document
DE 010			1	ed	Use 'protection metadata' in a consistent manner.	Replace 'Protection' by 'Protection metadata'.		Accepted.	For editing period	Implemented in Study of Jan Voges, only section 1, not the rest of the document
CH 011			1 1st bullet point	ed	"for the different available layers": Unclear what the layers are.	Clarify (e.g., for the different layers of genomic information file format).	Move to section 3 - Comment not in the proper place	Accepted.	For editing period	Explain (or point to where this is done) the hierarchy of the MPEG-G File
US 012			3	ge	Formatting should be revise. Excessive number of subsections and contains punctuation errors.	Revise the format.		Accepted.	For editing period	
DE 013		03.01		ed	Use 'bitstream' instead of 'bit stream'.	Use 'bitstream' instead of 'bit stream' in order to align with the other parts of the specification.		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	
DE 014		03.05		ed	How is a 'base length' defined?	Define 'base length' as 'number of subsequent bases adhering to a class (i.e. match, insertion, deletion w.r.t. to the reference sequence used for alignment) according to the CIGAR string specification'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 015		03.05		ed	Specify that the indicated reference is the one used for alignment.	Replace paragraph with: 'Sequence of base lengths and the associated operations used to indicate things like which bases align (either a match/mismatch) with the reference used for alignment, are deleted from the reference used for alignment, and are insertions that are not present in the reference used for alignment'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 016		03.08		ed	Mentioning 'nucleotides sequences' is redundant.	Remove.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 017		03.11		ed	If this applies also to unmapped records, remove 'mapped'.	If this applies also to unmapped records, remove 'mapped'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 018		03.12		ed	Fix spelling.	Replace 'the' by 'The'.		Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	
DE 019		03.15		ed	Specify that the indicated reference is the one used for alignment.	Specify that the indicated reference is the one used for alignment.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 020		03.16		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Replace paragraph with 'Value assigned to each nucleotide base call in automated sequencing processes, expressing the base-call accuracy'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
CH 021		03.16		ed	Use of words "Quality score" and "Quality value" should be made consistent between different parts.	Make consistent use of such words.	Add references wherever required - Comment not in the proper place		To check	Described in the same term in the glossary
DE 022		03.18		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Replace 'It is a digital' by 'Digital'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 023		03.19		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Replace 'It is a sequence by' 'Sequence'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 024		03.21		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Replace 'A contiguous' by 'Contiguous'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 025		03.22		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Replace 'The readout' by 'Readout'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
DE 026		03.23		ed	Formulate this as a definition.	Remove 'A'.			To be discussed	Implemented in Jan Voges StudyOf
US 027			4	ge	There are many abbreviations through the document that should be specified in this section. Eg: ENA, EGA, NCBI, SRA, URN, etc.	Please specify them in the Clause.		Accepted.	For editing period	
CH 028			4	ed	Being GIR the only abbreviation, it can be moved to the first occurrence of GIR, as "Genomic Information Representation (GIR)".	Move to the first occurrence of GIR, as "Genomic Information Representation (GIR)", as already done in part 2.	If part of the specification, XML should be moved from references into normative references. - Comment not in the proper place	Accepted.	Implemented in Draft-DIS	
US 029			6	ge	Extend the introduction to clearly define the concept of metadata within the context of this standard.	See Comments.			To be discussed	Copied from Part 2, but content should be revised
US 030			6	ge	No option for UUID (Universal Unique ID) in the metadata. This should be included and set its type to alphanumeric.	The inclusion of an alphanumeric UUID field on the metadata table.			To check	Clarify comment, likely already covered

